

1  
2  
3  
4 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
5 WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON  
6 AT SEATTLE

7 IN RE: PHENYLPROPANOLAMINE  
8 (PPA) PRODUCTS LIABILITY  
9 LITIGATION,  
10  
11

MDL NO. 1407

SUGGESTION OF REMAND  
ORDER

12 This document relates to the  
13 actions listed on Attachment A  
14

15 The Court, having reviewed the records of the cases listed  
16 on Attachment A, and having heard argument of counsel, finds and  
17 rules as follows:

18 (1) Common discovery and other coordinated pretrial proceed-  
19 ings have been completed. All remaining issues are case-specific,  
20 and best determined by the transferor courts.

21 (2) These cases will not benefit from further coordinated  
22 proceedings as part of MDL 1407, and are ready to be remanded to  
23 their respective transferor courts.

24 For these reasons, pursuant to Rule 7.6 of the Rules of  
25 Procedure of the Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation, the  
26 Court issues its Suggestion of Remand Order in the cases listed  
on Attachment A. The Clerk is ORDERED to provide copies of this  
Order to the Clerk of the Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litiga-  
tion and to the clerks of the transferor district courts listed

ORDER

Page - 1 -

1 on Appendix A.

2 DATED at Seattle, Washington this 12<sup>th</sup> day of March, 2004.

3  
4 s/ Barbara Jacobs Rothstein  
5 BARBARA JACOBS ROTHSTEIN  
6 UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26

**APPENDIX A**

WD WA Cause #	Case	Transferor Court/ Cause #
02-cv-538	Rhonda Bailey v. Schering-Plough Healthcare Products, Inc.	Western Dist. of Kentucky, No. 01-213
02-cv-29	Eleanor D. Beattie, et al. v. Novartis Consumer Health, Inc.	Middle Dist. of Louisiana (Baton Rouge), No. 01-1025
01-cv-2026	Londell Bell v. Bayer Corp., et al.	Western Dist. of Louisiana (Shreveport), No. 01-2018
01-cv-2137	Sharon Carter v. Bayer Corp.	Eastern Dist. of Kentucky(Covington), No. 01-199
02-cv-373	Lynette Fisk, et al. v. Novartis AG, et al.	Dist. of Utah (Central), No. 01-985
02-cv-1863	Daniel S. Goettsch v. Smithkline Beecham Consumer Healthcare, et al.	Dist. of Minnesota, No. 02-1268
01-cv-2227	Nina Hastings, et al. v. Novartis Corp.	Eastern Dist. of Texas (Sherman), No. 01-338
02-cv-1272	Gerald Jones, et al. v. Perrigo Co., et al.	Western Dist. of Kentucky (Bowling Green), No. 01-182
01-cv-1406	Stacey Kerrigan, et al. v. Whitehall-Robins, et al.	Dist. of Massachusetts, No. 01-10325
02-cv-420	Rose Lynn Kobar v. Novartis Corp., et al.	Dist. of Arizona (Phoenix), No. 01-156
02-cv-1020	Stephanie Lambert, et al. v. Bayer Corp., et al.	Western Dist. of Louisiana (Shreveport), No. 02-363
02-cv-21	Ronald Lewis, et al. v. Glaxosmithkline PLC, et al.	Dist. of Connecticut (New Haven), No. 01-2093

03-cv-2093	Barbara Ann Lupo v. Novartis Pharm. Corp., et al.	Southern Dist. of Mississippi (Eastern), severed from No. 01-169
02-cv-918	Bernadette Massey, et al. v. Sandoz Pharm. Corp., et al.	Southern Dist. of Texas (Houston), No. 01-3795
01-cv-2167	Lurline McKinney, et al. v. Bayer Corp., et al.	Western Dist. of Louisiana (Shreveport), No. 01-2219
03-cv-1390	Sandra Mustoe, et al. v. Bayer Corp., et al.	Northern Dist. of California, No. 01-4181
02-cv-278	Charles Newman, et al. v. American Home Products, et al.	Dist. of Nevada, No. 01-1345
02-cv-364	Lynne Nill, et al. v. Perrigo Sales Corp., et al.	Southern Dist. of Ohio (Cincinnati), No. 01-755
02-cv-1168	Tracy Patton v. Novartis Consumer Health, Inc.	Southern Dist. of Indiana (New Albany Div.), No. 02-47
01-cv-2164	Elvira S. Quarrels, et al. v. Bayer Corp.	Western Dist. of Louisiana (Monroe), No. 01-2195
02-cv-904	Sharon Roberts-Weisner, et al. v. Whitehall-Robins Healthcare, et al.	Dist. of Colorado (Denver), No. 02-240
01-cv-2166	Perry Robinson, et al. v. Bayer Corp., et al.	Western Dist. of Louisiana (Shreveport), No. 01-2217
01-cv-2172	Dennis Romero, et al. v. Bayer Corp.	Western Dist. of Louisiana (Lafayette), No. 01-2196
01-cv-1654	Pamela Silvey v. Smithkline Beecham Corp.	Southern Dist. of Ohio (Cincinnati), No. 01-164

01-cv-1656	Betty Lou Taylor, et al. v. Bayer Corp., et al.	Northern Dist. of Texas (Lubbock), No. 01-166
01-cv-2182	John Tutwiler, et al. v. Novartis Consumer Health	Southern Dist. of Ohio (Dayton), No. 01-447
01-cv-2100	Nathaniel Williams v. GlaxoSmithKline, PLC et al.	Western Dist. of Louisiana (Shreve- port), No. 01-1981
01-cv-1405	Alexander P. Ziolkowski v. Novartis Consumer Health, Inc., et al.	Dist. of Massachu- setts, No. 01-10324